

Student Ratings of Instruction and Student Achievement: A Meta-analysis of Multisection Validity Studies

 journals.sagepub.com/doi/abs/10.3102/00346543051003281

Abstract

The present study used meta-analytic methodology to synthesize research on the relationship between student ratings of instruction and student achievement. The data for the meta-analysis came from 41 independent validity studies reporting on 68 separate multisection courses relating student ratings to student achievement. The average correlation between an overall instructor rating and student achievement was .43; the average correlation between an overall course rating and student achievement was .47. While large effect sizes were also found for more specific rating dimensions such as Skill and Structure, other dimensions showed more modest relationships with student achievement. A hierarchical multiple regression analysis showed that rating/achievement correlations were larger for full-time faculty when students knew their final grades before rating instructors and when an external evaluator graded students' achievement tests. The results of the meta-analysis provide strong support for the validity of student ratings as measures of teaching effectiveness.

References

BendigAWThe relation of level of course achievement to students' instructor course ratings in introductory psychologyEducational and Psychological Measurement195313437448(a) [Google Scholar Abstract](#)

BendigAWStudent achievement in introductory psychology and student ratings of the competence and empathy of their instructorsJournal of Psychology195336427433(b) [Google Scholar](#)

BentonSEScottOA comparison of the criterion validity of two types of student response inventories for appraising instruction1976AprilPaper presented at the annual meeting of the National Council on Measurement in EducationSan Francisco(ERIC Document Reproduction Service No. ED 128 397) [Google Scholar](#)

BiglanAThe characteristics of subject matter in different academic areasJournal of Applied Psychology197358195203 [Google Scholar](#)

BoltonBBongeDMarrJRatings of instruction, examination performance, and subsequent enrollment in psychology coursesTeaching of Psychology197968285 [Google Scholar Abstract](#)

BorgWRHamiltonERComparison between a performance test and criteria of instructor effectivenessPsychological Reports19562111116 [Google Scholar Abstract](#)

BrachtGHGlassGVThe external validity of experimentsAmerican Educational Research Journal19685437474 [Google Scholar Abstract](#)

BraskampLACaulleyDCostinFStudent ratings and instructor self-ratings and their relationship to student achievementAmerican Educational Research Journal197916295306 [Google Scholar Abstract](#)

BrysonRTeacher evaluations and student learning: A reexaminationThe Journal of Educational Research1974681214 [Google Scholar](#)

CampbellDTRRecommendations for APA test standards regarding construct, trait, and discriminant validityAmerican Psychologist196015546553 [Google Scholar](#)

CampbellDTStanleyJCGageNLExperimental and quasi-experimental designs for research on teachingHandbook of research on teaching1963ChicagoRand-McNally [Google Scholar](#)

-
- Carnegie Commission on Higher Education A classification of institutions of higher education 1976 Berkeley, Calif The Carnegie Foundation for the Advancement of Teaching (Rev. ed.) [Google Scholar](#)
-
- Centra JA Student ratings of instruction and their relationship to student learning American Educational Research Journal 1977 14:1724 [Google Scholar Abstract](#)
-
- Centra JA Determining faculty effectiveness 1979 San Francisco Jossey-Bass [Google Scholar](#)
-
- Chandler TA The questionable status of student evaluations of teaching Teaching of Psychology 1978 5:150-152 [Google Scholar Abstract](#)
-
- Chase CI Keene JM Validity of student ratings of faculty 1979 Bloomington, Ind Bureau of Educational Studies and Testing, Indiana University (ERIC Document Reproduction Service No. ED 169 870) [Google Scholar](#)
-
- Cohen J Statistical power analysis for the behavioral sciences 1977 New York Academic Press (Rev. ed.) [Google Scholar](#)
-
- Cohen J Cohen P Applied multiple regression/correlation analysis for the behavioral sciences 1975 Hillsdale, N.J. Lawrence Erlbaum [Google Scholar](#)
-
- Cohen P A Effectiveness of student-rating feedback for improving college instruction: A meta-analysis of findings Research in Higher Education 1980 13:321-341 (a) [Google Scholar CrossRef](#)
-
- Cohen P A *meta-analysis of the relationship between student ratings of instruction and student achievement*. (Doctoral dissertation, University of Michigan, 1980) Dissertation Abstracts International 1980 415-A2012 (University Microfilms No. 8025666) (b) [Google Scholar](#)
-
- Cohen P A Ebeling B J Kulik J A A meta-analysis of outcome studies of visual-based instruction Educational Communication and Technology Journal 1981 29:263-266 [Google Scholar](#)
-
- Cohen S H Berger W G Dimensions of students' ratings of college instructors underlying subsequent achievement on course examinations Proceedings of the 78th Annual Convention of the American Psychological Association 1970 56:560-566 (Summary) [Google Scholar](#)
-
- Costin F Do student ratings of college teachers predict student achievement? Teaching of Psychology 1978 5:86-88 [Google Scholar Abstract](#)
-
- Costin F Greenough W T Menges R J Student ratings of college teaching: Reliability, validity, and usefulness Review of Educational Research 1971 41:511-535 [Google Scholar Abstract](#)
-
- Crooks T J Smock H R Student ratings of instructors related to student achievement 1974 Urbana, Ill Office of Instructional Resources, University of Illinois [Google Scholar](#)
-
- Doyle K O Student evaluation of instruction 1975 Lexington, Mass D. C. Heath [Google Scholar](#)
-
- Doyle K O Crichton L I Student, peer, and self-evaluations of college instructors Journal of Educational Psychology 1978 70:815-826 [Google Scholar](#)
-
- Doyle K O Whitely S E Student ratings as criteria for effective teaching American Educational Research Journal 1974 11:259-274 [Google Scholar Abstract](#)
-
- Elliott D N Characteristics and relationships of various criteria of college and university teaching Purdue University Studies in Higher Education 1950 7:56-61 [Google Scholar](#)
-
- Ellis N R Rickard H C Evaluating the teaching of introductory psychology Teaching of Psychology 1977 4:128-132 [Google Scholar Abstract](#)
-
- Endo G T Della-Piana G A validation study of course evaluation ratings Improving College and University Teaching 1976 24:48-56 [Google Scholar](#)
-

FeldmanKA Grades and college students' evaluations of their courses and teachers Research in Higher Education 1976469111 [Google Scholar](#)

FollmanJ Student ratings and student achievement JSAS Catalog of Selected Documents in Psychology 19744136(Ms. No. 791) [Google Scholar](#)

FreyPW Student ratings of teaching: Validity of several rating factors Science 19731828385 [Google Scholar](#)

FreyPW Validity of student instructional ratings: Does timing matter? Journal of Higher Education 197647327336 [Google Scholar](#)

FreyPW LeonardDW BeattyWW Student ratings of instruction: Validation research American Educational Research Journal 197512435447 [Google Scholar Abstract](#)

GageNL GlasmanNS KillaitBR Students' ratings of college teaching: Their justification and proper use Second UCSB Conference of Effective Teaching 1974 Santa Barbara, Calif Graduate School of Education and Office of Instructional Development, University of California, Santa Barbara [Google Scholar](#)

GessnerPK Evaluation of instruction Science 1973180566570 [Google Scholar](#)

GlassGV Primary, secondary, and meta-analysis of research Educational Researcher 1976538 [Google Scholar Link](#)

GlassGV ShulmanLS Integrating findings: The meta-analysis of research Review of research in education 197851tasca, III F. E. Peacock [Google Scholar](#)

GlassGV SmithML Meta-analysis of research on class size and achievement Educational Evaluation and Policy Analysis 19791216 [Google Scholar Link](#)

GlassGV StanleyJC Statistical methods in education and psychology 1970 Englewood Cliffs, N. J Prentice-Hall [Google Scholar](#)

GreenwoodGE A study of the validity of four types of student ratings of college teaching assessed on a criterion of student achievement gains Research in Higher Education 19765171178 [Google Scholar](#)

GrushJECostinF The student as consumer of the teaching process American Educational Research Journal 1975125566 [Google Scholar Abstract](#)

Guide to DIALOG searching 1979 Palo Alto, Calif Lockheed DIALOG Information Retrieval Service, Lockheed Missiles & Space Company

HallJA Gender effects in decoding non-verbal cues Psychological Bulletin 197885845857 [Google Scholar](#)

HoffmanRG Variables affecting university student ratings of instructor behavior American Educational Research Journal 197815287299 [Google Scholar Abstract](#)

IsaacsonRL Dimensions of student evaluations of teaching Journal of Educational Psychology 196455344351 [Google Scholar](#)

KulikC-L KulikJACohenPA Instructional technology and college teaching Teaching of Psychology 19807199205 [Google Scholar Abstract](#)

KulikJACohenPA EbelingBJ Effectiveness of programmed instruction in higher education: A meta-analysis of findings Educational Evaluation and Policy Analysis 1980265164 [Google Scholar Abstract](#)

KulikJAKulikC-LC Student ratings of instruction Teaching of Psychology 197415157 [Google Scholar Abstract](#)

KulikJAKulikC-LC CohenPAA meta-analysis of outcome studies of Keller's personalized system of instruction American Psychologist 197934307318(a) [Google Scholar](#)

KulikJAKulikC-LCCohenPAResearch on audio-tutorial instruction: A meta-analysis of comparative studiesResearch in Higher Education197911321341(b) [Google Scholar](#)

KulikJAKulikC-LCCohenPAEffectiveness of computer-based college teaching: A meta-analysis of findingsReview of Educational Research198050525544 [Google Scholar Abstract](#)

KulikJAMcKeachieWJKerlingerFNThe evaluation of teachers in higher education Review of research in education19753Itasca, IllPeacock [Google Scholar](#)

LeventhalLTeacher rating forms: Critique and reformulation of previous validation designsCanadian Psychological Review197516269276 [Google Scholar](#)

LeventhalLAbramiPPerryRBogus evidence for the validity of student ratings1977AugustPaper presented at the annual meeting of the American Psychological AssociationSan Francisco(ERIC Document Reproduction Service No. ED 150 510) [Google Scholar](#)

LeventhalLSection selection in multi-section courses: Implications for the validation and use of teacher rating formsEducational and Psychological Measurement197535885895 [Google Scholar Abstract](#)

MarshHWResearch on students' evaluations of teaching effectiveness: A reply to Vecchio Instructional Evaluation198042513 [Google Scholar](#)

MarshHWFleinerJThomasCSValidity and usefulness of student evaluations of instructional quality Journal of Educational Psychology197567833839 [Google Scholar](#)

MarshHWOOverallJUValidity of students' evaluations of teaching effectiveness: Cognitive and affective criteriaJournal of Educational Psychology198072468475 [Google Scholar](#)

MaugerPAKolmodinCALong-term predictive validity of the Scholastic Aptitude Test Journal of Educational Psychology197567847851 [Google Scholar](#)

McKeachieWJStudent ratings of faculty: A reprise Academe197965384397 [Google Scholar CrossRef](#)

McKeachieWJLinY-GMannWStudent ratings of teacher effectiveness: Validity studiesAmerican Educational Research Journal19718435445 [Google Scholar Abstract](#)

MintzesJJField test and validation of a teaching evaluation instrument: The Student Opinion of Teaching1977Windsor, OntarioUniversity of Windsor(ERIC Document Reproduction Service No. ED 146 185) [Google Scholar](#)

MorshJEBurgessGGSmithPNStudent achievement as a measure of instructor effectivenessJournal of Educational Psychology1956477988 [Google Scholar](#)

MurdockRPTThe effect of student ratings of their instructor on the student's achievement and rating1969Salt Lake City, UtUniversity of Utah(ERIC Document Reproduction Service No. ED 034 715) [Google Scholar](#)

PetersonPLPetersonPLWalbergHJDirect instruction reconsideredResearch on teaching1979Berkeley, CalifMcCutchan [Google Scholar](#)

RankinEFGreenmumRTracyRJFactors related to student evaluations of a college reading course Journal of Reading196591015 [Google Scholar](#)

RemmersHHMartinFDElliottDNAre students' ratings of instructors related to their grades? Purdue University Studies in Higher Education1949661726 [Google Scholar](#)

ReynoldsDVHansvickCGraduate instructors who grade higher receive lower evaluations by students1978SeptemberPaper presented at the annual meeting of the American Psychological AssociationToronto, Ontario [Google Scholar](#)

RodinMRodinBStudent evaluations of teachersScience19721771,1641,166 [Google Scholar](#)

-
- RosenthalRExperimenter effects in behavioral research1976New YorkIrvington [Google Scholar](#)
-
- RubinsteinJMitchellIHFeeling free, student involvement, and appreciationProceedings of the 78th Convention of the American Psychological Association19705623624(Summary) [Google Scholar](#)
-
- SeibertWFERicksenSCStudent evaluations of instructionSupport for teaching at major universities1979Ann Arbor, MichUniversity of Michigan, Center for Research on Learning and Teaching [Google Scholar](#)
-
- SeldinPSuccessful faculty evaluation programs1980Crugers, New YorkCoventry Press [Google Scholar](#)
-
- SheehanDSOn the invalidity of student ratings for administrative personnel decisionsJournal of Higher Education197546687700 [Google Scholar](#)
-
- SmithMLGlassGVMeta-analysis of psychotherapy outcome studiesAmerican Psychologist197732752760 [Google Scholar Medline](#)
-
- SolomonDRosenbergLBezdekWETeacher behavior and student learningJournal of Educational Psychology1964552330 [Google Scholar](#)
-
- SorgeDHKlineCEVerbal behavior of college instructors and attendant effect upon student attitudes and achievementCollege Student Journal1973742429 [Google Scholar](#)
-
- SpencerREDickWCourse evaluation questionnaire: Manual of interpretation1965Urbana, IllOffice of Instructional Resources, University of Illinois(Research Report No. 200) [Google Scholar](#)
-
- SullivanAMSkanesGRValidity of student evaluation of teaching and the characteristics of successful instructorsJournal of Educational Psychology 197466584590 [Google Scholar](#)
-
- TurnerRLThompsonRPRelationships between college student ratings of instructors and residual learning1974AprilPaper presented at the annual meeting of the American Educational Research AssociationChicago [Google Scholar](#)
-
- VecchioRPStudent ratings of instructors: Should we take them seriously?Instructional Evaluation19804214 [Google Scholar](#)
-
- WareJEWiliamsRGThe Dr. Fox effect: A study of lecture effectiveness and ratings of instruction Journal of Medical Education197550149156 [Google Scholar](#)
-
- WherryRJControl of bias in ratings1952Washington, D.CDepartment of the Army, The Adjutant General's Office(PRS Reports 914, 915, 919, 920, and 921) [Google Scholar](#)
-
- WhitelySEDoyleKOValidity and generalizability of student ratings from between-classes and within-class dataJournal of Educational Psychology 197971117124 [Google Scholar](#)
-

SEBASTIAN STEHLE is a research fellow at the Interdisciplinary Centre for Teaching in Higher Education at Goethe University, Frankfurt, Germany. His research interests include learning and teaching in higher education and assessing teacher competencies.

BIRGIT SPINATH is a professor of educational psychology at Heidelberg University, Germany. Her research interests include learning and teaching in schools and higher education institutions, motivational prerequisites to learning and achievement, and institutional research in higher education.

The authors would like to acknowledge the contributions of A. Celeste Farr and the faculty and students of the College of Communication Arts and Sciences at Michigan State University to this project

Authors

Dr Michael Townsend and Dr Dennis Moore are Senior Lecturers in the Department of Education, University of

Auckland, Private Bag 92019, Auckland, New Zealand.