

STUDY OF EDUCATIONAL NEEDS IN KOSOVO

By

Arni Arnthorsson, Ph.D.

ACKNOWLEDGMENTS

Several individuals have been very helpful in the completion of this study. Many faculty members, administration, and staff have provided information and feedback to my questions. I could not hope to list all of the people who helped here, but a few are important to mention. Dan Cosentino provided very useful data, papers, and sat with me discussing several issues regarding the IT program. Granit Berisha was invaluable in providing connections to various experts and leaders in government, and in the Kosovo community in general. Ardian Jashari gave me helpful tips, and provided connections as well. Jim Myers helped me with the recommendations and logistics of the report with his input on RIT processes and procedures, as well as with his vast knowledge of A.U.K. Board members Rezart Spahia and Shaun Byrnes were greatly supportive of the study, and provided assistance when needed.

Three people, Leonard Heritage, Dr. Lorraina Pinnell, and Dr. Tom Phillips offered to read my drafts, and provided invaluable suggestions to improve the report.

Finally, I have to mention my two research assistants, Adriana Sejfia and Lumbardh Zagragja. These two A.U.K. students were as good as anyone could ask for. They provided translations, made calls for interviews, prepared for interviews, recorded the interviews, did data entry, and other work that would never have been done without their hard work and dedication.

Table of Contents

Introduction…………………………………………………………………………………………………………………………… 1

Literature Review…………………………………………………………………………………………………………………… 1

Study Methods……………………………………………………………………………………………………………………….. 4

Results …………………………………………………………………………………………………………………………………. 7

* Organizational Demographics……………………………………………………………………………… 7
* Fields of Study……………………………………………………………………………………………………… 8
* Skills…………………………………………………………………………………………………………………….. 12
* Additional Comments……………..………………………………………………………………………….. 14
* Internal Audit………………………………………………………………………………………………………. 15

Recommendations…………………………………………………………………………………………………………………… 18

* Logistics………………………………………………………………………………………………………………… 20
* Planning Method for Curriculum Development and New Programs…………………….. 21
* Curriculum Assessment………………………………………………………………………………………… 22
* Co-Op Programs and Internships…………………………………………………………………………. 24
* Communication……………………………………………………………………………………………………. 25
* Training & Development Institute………………………………………………………………………… 26

Conclusions……………………………………………………………………………………………………………………………… 27

Appendix A………………………………………………………………………………………………………………………………. 28

Appendix B………………………………………………………………………………………………………………………………. 33

Appendix C……………………………………………………………………………………………………………………………….. 35

Appendix D……………………………………………………………………………………………………………………………….. 41

References……………………………………………………………………………………………………………………………….. 42

**EXECUTIVE SUMMARY**

This study examines the TERTIARY educational needs in Kosovo. Review of past studies revealed limited information on specific needs or suggestions on how to solve the problem. A total of 24 experts from various industries, organizations, and government were interviewed. Gaps in fields of study as well as skills were identified. The fields identified as most needed are Accounting, IT, Marketing, Human Resource Management, and Agricultural Engineering and Management. While some of these fields of study exist already in the university system in Kosovo, the experts showed concern over lack of various business and entrepreneurial skills currently provided. Lack of education in International Relations was related to inability to create a sustainable global exporting system across all industries. This assessment leads to a further conclusion that several basic skills expected from college graduates are missing. The skills identified as most important included Organizational Management, Efficient Planning, Critical Thinking, Analytical skills, Positive Attitude, Work Ethic, Time Management, Writing Reports, Self-Discipline, Self-Motivation, Teamwork, and Team Motivation.

It is recommended that Higher education authorities in Kosovo create a strategic plan for improvements with a timeline involving a five-year plan, matching the needs of Kosovo. This plan would include curriculum improvement for current courses, changes in current fields of study, adding fields of study, improving or adding student service programs, improving faculty development, improving strategic external and internal communications, and creating a strong relationship with industry that will enable universities to have a continuous quality assessment of all programs.

**INTRODUCTION**

Kosovo is a country steeped in history, but has had independence for only 7 short years. The 2 million residents are mostly Albanian. Upon the departure of Serbian authorities in 1999 the university system in Kosovo had to be rebuilt. Rexhaj (2001) suggested during isolation in the nineties, higher education in Kosovo focused more on survival rather than any reform, development, or training. The largest university, by far, is University of Prishtina, a public University with approximately 12,000 students. UP has in some ways become a holding cell for the many unemployed youth in the country. It has been mired in controversy, with the latest being the accusations against the rector due to a suspect publication record. He resigned from his post this spring. Several private universities have opened in the last few years, but the quality and accreditation of these universities is suspect for the most part. Only one private university, A.U.K., offers degrees with respected accreditation from the U.S.

 Given the concerns for the quality of education in Kosovo this study examines the potential need for reform, training, and development in the higher education system in the country. For a new country with very high unemployment rate and very low potential for growth (due to lack of funds and lack of sustainable entrepreneurial opportunities), education seems to be the best way to create a long-term economic growth. Data is hard to come by in Kosovo and very few studies have examined the educational needs in Kosovo. Several experts in government and business were interviewed to assess the perspective of the quality of educational programs in Kosovo, as well as determining the knowledge and skills needed for the development of Kosovo. The study will assess the gaps that may exist between the education offered in higher education in Kosovo, and the current needs in the country.

**LITERATURE REVIEW**

Several studies were gathered to examine what has already been done in assessing education in Kosovo. Almost all of these studies and reports were created by the EU, the UN, or by NGO’s related to these organizations in Kosovo. Most of the studies are of no value to this report for various reasons. Some of the studies are fairly outdated. Analysis showed that anything published before the creation of Kosovo independence did not apply. Other studies did not target tertiary education, but rather spoke of K-12 education needs. The most important flaw in these studies (relevant to tertiary education or not) is that they are too broad, and too general. The typical outcome was that there were problems, but rarely were the problems directly identified. Furthermore, no studies suggested a course of action on how to improve the current situation. It is of little value to decision makers to have problems identified without suggestions for improvement.

However, a couple of studies did provide valuable insights to the state of education in Kosovo. For example, only “one third of young people feel school is preparing them well for life yet, positively, most feel that learning still has an inherent value” (Kosovo Human Development Report 2012, pg. 34). This suggests that young people do know the value of education but consider what they get here in Kosovo of little value. This is supported by some of the comments made by experts as will be revealed later in this report.

Furthermore, there is a disconnect between entrepreneurs, and those they employ. Most business ventures in Kosovo begin with a very limited vision of the future, no long-term planning, and in almost all cases expansion of the marketplace is not examined. Therefore there is no desire to “foster desire” for improvement of skills and knowledge among employees. Recommendations were made to business owners to improve their understanding of education as means to a better workforce, better compliance, and improved fairness in the workplace. This would benefit business owners in improved production and ultimately improved society (Kosovo Human Development Report 2012).

Most importantly, as business grows the higher the need for a workforce with better skills. In fact, medium sized businesses in Kosovo, identified lack of a qualified workforce as the biggest obstacle to growth. In particular this shows when a company grows from a small family-run operation to one that requires an organizational structure of management, long-term plans, and strategic marketing plans. “Based on the perceptions of the medium sized firms interviewed, the educational background of potential workers is very disproportional to their current business needs.” (Kosovo Human Development Report 2012. Pg. 45) Even more troublesome is the lack of knowledge and skill of those who have graduated from a tertiary institution. It is highly costly to have to train these people for up to a year when they should already have the necessary skills for middle-level management (Kosovo Human Development Report 2012). This sentiment was echoed by several of our experts who expressed disappointment of college graduates who could not complete fundamental tasks within their supposed specialties. Investment in additional training means months of little or no productivity among these new hires; an investment a firm should not need to put forth.

It is worth noting that several of the reports are in agreement with the experts we interviewed on the severe limitations of elementary education in Kosovo. Most educators have no understanding of pedagogy and curriculum development (Dukagjin Pupovci). Analytical skills, critical thinking skills, fundamental math and statistics skills, and communication skills are all lacking. There is no understanding of outcomes assessment in the curriculum among elementary and high schools. This gap continues in most tertiary institutions for the same reasons. Teachers are not trained to examine outcomes. The professors provide students input and do not understand the process of examining whether students have indeed obtained any of the fundamental skills needed for successful education and employment.

Only one sector has made an effort to examine the educational needs within their industry; technology and information. A report from 2011 STIKK (Kosovo Association of Technology and Information) confirmed a steady growth in the sector with a continuing need for programmers, and in particular, employees with a mix of programming and management skills. While the report found ample numbers of college graduates within the field it also found a significant gap between the needs of the industry and the skills of those graduates. This means the companies have to spend anywhere from 3-12 months training their new hires to match their needs. (Skills Gap Analysis for Information and Communication Technology, 2011)

The most significant finding was the absolute lack of communication between the industry, education policy makers, and educational institutions. The report went as far as suggesting that this creates a circumstance where “Kosovo youth loses their time, their money and prospects of employment and future life.” (Skills Gap Analysis for Information and Communication Technology, 2011, pg. 5)

The problem is not industry specific as several of the interviewees in our study confirmed. A general lack of both hard and soft skills needed in almost all fields (accounting, marketing, economics, health care management, etc.) seems to be very common when hiring new college graduates in Kosovo.

This is not just a problem in Kosovo. Globally there are clear signs of decline in the education of soft skills. In a report from Ireland (The Expert Group on Future Skills Needs Statement of Activity 2012, April 2013) the greatest gaps reported were in the IT sector, marketing and sales, engineering, food and beverage fields, and health care. Various soft skills (e.g., communication, critical thinking, analytical skills, work ethic) were found seriously lacking, and need for experience in international relations, knowledge of global business strategies, and global logistics is considered critical.

**STUDY METHODS**

The interview method was used for the study. Interviews are generally used when experts are the main source of information. This allows for a more in-depth discussion on issues brought up during the interview. This is particularly important when the experts may be familiar with the specifics of their own field, but perhaps not clear on the educational side of their fields. The interview allowed the researcher to have clear understanding of what was being stated by the interviewee.

A survey instrument was created to make the process of the interviews clear and organized (see Appendix A). The instrument had three parts to it. The first part of the study asked for general information on the interviewee, his/her organization, and general need of college graduates. In some instances the questions were specific to a company. In other instances, such as when interviewing heads of associations, the questions were focused on the industry or industries involved. A few of the experts were not asked all of the questions in the first part as they represented themselves rather than any organization. The second part of the study asked about “fields of study,” “majors,” and “concentrations,” that are missing in Kosovo. Each one of those terms was used interchangeably to assure understanding of the question. Furthermore, when a field of study was identified the interview allowed us to ask further on specific skills within those fields considered most important. For the third and final part of the study we created an extensive list of both hard and soft skills. The list of skills was based on several publications as well as input from faculty at A.U.K. and other experts. On a four-point importance scale the interviewee responded, and was allowed to add skills they felt might be important as well. The interviewees were allowed to add to this list if they felt a skill was missing.

The interview method allowed us to ask probing questions on both the background of the interviewees and their organization. Also, the interviews yielded many discussions on both fields of study and skills relevant to education in general as well as skills specific to particular industries. A deeper understanding of WHY the fields of study and skills were important provided valuable insights into needs of education in Kosovo. Additionally, many of the interviewees voiced strong emphasis on needs of certain skills, and extensive notes of each interview were taken to capture the essence of their expertise.

The interviews took place in the offices of the interviewees, or in a neutral location chosen by the interviewee (coffeehouses, etc.). They lasted anywhere from 45-75 minutes. Mostly the interviews were conducted in English although on a few occasions an interpreter was required.

To identify the experts several e-mails were sent to various individuals both within A.U.K. and outside it. Various Chambers of Commerce were contacted and they provided us with lists of companies and their leaders. Also, government leaders were identified and contacted. Various associations were contacted to identify experts who could provide us with insights on gaps of skills and education within their fields. Finally, international organizations that have examined educational needs, or have hired many college graduates from Kosovo, were contacted (see Appendix B for a complete list of experts interviewed).

Although the interviews conducted provided a very clear picture of needs in Kosovo there are always limits to any study. Several of the contacts were unable to give us an interview, or send us feedback via e-mail. Given the time frame of the study we could not continue to pursue those leads. Furthermore, the information obtained has covered most sectors and needs in Kosovo. More feedback will be welcomed, and should be sought. The industries were fairly equally represented with no more than two interviewees in each specific field. However, the same needs were identified across various fields, for example with regard to Human Resource Management, IT, Marketing, International Relations, and Accounting.

**RESULTS**

A total of 24 interviews were conducted. Each interview was tabulated using SPSS statistical package as the tool of analysis. All added comments were recorded and are referred to in the analysis (for a complete list of comments see Appendix C).

**Organization Demographics.**

Almost all the respondents were either the leader of the organization in question, or the expert to whom the leader directed us for information (such as a Human Resource Manager). The experts represented a variety of industries and organizations. The experts were chosen from different fields to provide the best coverage possible in expertise. It would have been helpful to have better coverage in the health-care administration field, but no person emerged despite several attempts at interviews. However, some of the experts provided a variety of input relevant to many fields including health care (see Appendix B for organizations of experts).

We wanted to examine the relevance of college undergraduate degrees to the various organizations the experts presented. The number of college graduates employed by these organizations varied from 50-95% of the total number of employees. Some of these organizations rely on a blue-collar labor market for employees but all stated that in the relevant positions people with college degrees were employed. The fields emerging as most lacking for college graduates were Human Resource Management, Actuarial Science/Statistical Research, Food Management and Engineering, and Marketing.

A far more common response was that the fields of study were available in Kosovo institutions of higher education, but the graduates from these programs were lacking fundamental skills that should be expected of them after receiving a degree. Fields such as Accounting, Engineering (of varying kind), Marketing, Human Resource Management, Information and Technology, and Economics were commonly revealed as fields where organizations had to impose a rigid training regimen in order to make the new college hires employable and productive.

**Fields of Study.**

The most common comments across almost all fields were concerning the lack of core business skills. While entrepreneurship and development of various businesses is common in Kosovo, the country lacks experts in various fields of management and marketing. Furthermore, the lack of employees with strong critical thinking and analytical skills is quite serious across the board. Various engineering degrees are lacking in Kosovo as well. Two fields of study that do not exist in Kosovo, and deemed very important are Health Care Management/Administration and Agricultural Engineering and Management. While certain fields of study emerged as needed here, the complaints were more on the quality of what is currently offered. The expectation in higher quality organizations in Kosovo is that when a college graduate is hired s/he will need considerable training before being productive. This means the education system is not providing students with fundamental skills, both specific to industries, and in many soft skills as reported by these experts. The fields of study emerging as most needed are shown in Table 1 on the following page.

|  |
| --- |
| TABLE 1EDUCATION FIELDS |
| FIELDS | SECTORS IN NEED |
| Human Resource Management | All private sectors, government |
| Agricultural Engineering and Management  | Agriculture, horticulture, food production |
| Accounting/Audit/Actuarial Science | Banking, Insurance, private industries |
| IT | Technology and information, banking, government |
| Health Care Management | Health care and hospitals |
| Marketing and Marketing Research | All private sectors |
| Technical Engineering | Information and Technology |
| Systems Engineering | Construction, urban planning |
| Energy Management and Engineering | Energy field, government |
| International Relations | Most private sectors and government |

Of the fields in Table 1, the most frequently mentioned were Accounting, IT, Marketing, Human Resource Management, and Agricultural Engineering and Management. Many experts showed concern over lack of various business and entrepreneurial skills. Lack of education in International Relations was related to inability to create a sustainable global exporting system across all industries. So far, the exporting of goods produced in Kosovo is more accidental, or focused on the Albanian diaspora, rather than systematic efforts to enter markets in other countries. Knowledge of foreign markets would allow the producers to adjust their products according to the interests and tastes globally rather than locally.

A closer look at Table 1 shows what Kosovo needs most is a detailed and rigorous business education across all fields. While most of these fields of study are present in Kosovo, it is clear that current supply of graduates is not meeting the needs of industry. This means the universities here in Kosovo are simply not doing their job. Furthermore, according to experts, operations such as health care, IT, and agriculture lack business expertise specific to their fields. This suggests universities may have to create co-ops or internships more geared toward the needs of these industries, as well as programs that offer fundamentals within these fields along with strong business education.

The Ministry of Trade and Industry identified IT as the biggest growth sector in Kosovo (Bernard Nikaj). At the same time Vjollca Cavolli, Executive Director at STIKK (Kosovo Association of Information and Technology), stated that what is hampering true growth in the sector is lack of graduates who excel in entrepreneurship, management, and marketing. Her view is that the IT programs should have better programming training along with rigorous business training. According to Vjollca most new ideas do not get realized into business entities because of lack of the necessary understanding of what it takes to run a business in the first place, and then how to expand it as it grows. Driton Hapciu (Cacttus, an IT company in Prishtina) claims after visiting IT departments at Stanford and MIT that what students are learning there is completely different from what graduates are learning in IT programs in Kosovo. Secondly, various engineering fields are necessary to create effective manufacturing and logistical business systems. Such knowledge is scarce in Kosovo. Energy engineering is critical for the improvement of industries in Kosovo (Bernard Nikaj) and Kosovo lacks qualified people to create sustainable energy sources as well as hi-tech ventures such as co-generational plants (trash burned for energy).

Food engineering and management is critical for Kosovo. A large part of the low level workforce is located in this sector. However, it is not self-sufficient, and the sector is poorly organized.

Many of the experts have grave concern over lack of skills in marketing. Mr. Vllaznim Xhahi, a former entrepreneur, and current chairman of EYE which encourages and invests in entrepreneurs in Kosovo, states that most of the entrepreneurs he assists have no understanding of market research, getting to know the segments, the market viability, long-term planning of expansion, branding, and how to communicate effectively. Both Shkelzen Kelmendi at NLB Prishtina and Vjollca Cavolli at STIKK reported difficulty in finding qualified market researchers, who could both analyze a market and create effective communication on the basis of research.

Additionally, Vjollca Cavolli (STIKK) and Agon Gashi, CEO of Meridian Express, stated it was near impossible to find experts in Human Resource Management. There is lack of college graduates who understand organization theory, motivation tools, assessment of employees, and strategic planning of effectiveness.

According to Stephen Caskoff, a long time consultant on international trade and legal issues in Kosovo, the current circumstances call for growth in service sectors rather than product sectors in Kosovo. With the electrical power grid as unreliable as it is here, industries will remain underdeveloped, and natural resources are scarce. Mr. Caskoff maintains the most valuable resource in Kosovo is its people, making high-quality education an absolute necessity. As such, educational institutions should therefore offer concentrations and provide skills that help fields such as accounting, law, marketing, IT, human resource management, and international relations. Mr. Vllaznim Xhahi agrees there is great need to educate entrepreneurs in management, marketing and sales, and in planning.

**Skills.**

Thirty-four skills were listed, and the interviewees were asked to assess them on a 4-point importance scale (see Appendix A). While most of these skills are considered important to one degree or another, there were a few that emerged as most important across all fields. Table 2 below shows the soft skills most needed according to the experts interviewed. The table reports the mean score on a 4-point importance scale (1 = very important, 2 = somewhat important, 3 = somewhat unimportant, 4 = very unimportant) and the percentage of interviewees who deemed the skill as most important for Kosovo.

|  |
| --- |
| TABLE 2Most needed skills in Kosovo\* |
| SKILLS | AVERAGE SCORE ON A 4-POINT SCALE | PERCENTAGE MOST IMPORTANT |
| Critical Thinking | 1.08 | 91.7% |
| Analytical skills | 1.12 | 78.3% |
| Organizational Management | 1.13 | 87.0% |
| Work Ethic | 1.16 | 87.5% |
| Self-Motivation | 1.21 | 78.3% |
| Efficient Planning | 1.21 | 78.3% |
| Positive Attitude | 1.25 | 75.0% |
| Self-Discipline | 1.25 | 75.0% |
| Teamwork | 1.25 | 75.0% |
| Writing Reports | 1.29 | 70.8% |
| Team Motivation | 1.29 | 70.8% |
| Time Management | 1.29 | 70.8% |
| \*A table with a complete list of the skills is in Appendix D  |

Many of the experts voiced concern over the lack of these skills from college graduates. Related to these skills the experts spoke of lack of professional integrity, too much dependence on others for motivation, and not knowing how the most basic elements of organization operate. Not all the skills are listed here, but were considered important within particular fields (such as Excel for accounting and banking). In the recommendations part of this report, skills specific to critical sectors will be discussed further.

As can be seen in Table 2, four skills are clearly most important to Kosovo. Statistically they separate themselves from the rest. Almost all the skills listed are deemed to be of importance, but to a varying degree. Other skills can be examined as specifically important to the field. All the skills should be examined with a field of study in mind. Some of the soft skills are defined differently depending on the field. For example, when it came to critical thinking skills the experts in the technical field defined it as the ability to look at a programming problem and solve it. In the human resource area critical thinking skills were defined more on the basis of ability to analyze problems and determine, for example, what might be the cause of lack of sales in a specific area.

Though not in Table 2, math and statistical skills are very much related to analytical skills. Several of the experts stated in this field of study Kosovo has a major problem across all levels of education. This is supported by math professors at A.U.K. who find many students lacking when taking basic levels of college math.

The rest of the skills should be incorporated into the curriculum within each field, and are clear elements of outcomes assessment within said fields. Several of the experts expressed frustration with the educational system in Kosovo not focusing enough on critical soft skills.

Dukagjin Pupovci (Director of Kosovo Education Center), who is generally considered to be the foremost authority of education in Kosovo, stated there are two fundamental problems hindering effective education in Kosovo. First, educators are not trained in curriculum development. Teacher training focuses on input rather than process and output. This means there are no outcomes set, and no assessment of the effectiveness of education. Second, teachers have received no training in pedagogy. This means they do not have any understanding of, among other things, varying learning methods, mental processes, knowledge development, motivational methods, and learning structures. According to Pupovci this is true from first grade to university level graduate degrees. In essence, the students are perceived as objects rather than critical thinkers and active learners.

Both Bernard Nikaj (Senior Political Adviser, Ministry of Trade and Industry) and Ardiana Bunjaku (Executive Director, Society of Accountants and Auditors in Kosovo) expressed similar sentiments regarding education quality in Kosovo. Currently education in Kosovo does not produce graduates with strong communication skills, independent and pro-active thinking skills, strong analytical skills, or the desire to make a difference through professional integrity, hard work, and ethical behavior.

Finally, some of the experts felt graduates are thinking too small, and higher education is not encouraging students to be creative. According to Blerim Gjoci (Director, The Group), the education system in Kosovo has not kept up with changes in the world, and is still suffering from the effects of being a new country. For Kosovo to become self-sustainable, industries need graduates who are ready to expand business globally with their expertise in business and international relations.

**RECOMMENDATIONS**

The recommendations are based on the data gathered. There are many possible interpretations, and it is absolutely necessary for educational experts to examine the study, the results, and make their own conclusions. Given the time limit of the study, such input could not be gathered and presented here. When recommendations are implemented it is always a dynamic process which constantly changes on the basis of new information and new insights.

On the basis of the analysis it is recommended to put a strategic plan in place for improvements. Below is an outline of general plan any university in Kosovo could undertake.

1. Implementation.
	1. Create an external advisory committee for all concentrations. Both current and new programs need external advisers involved in the program design process.
	2. Assessment of skills provided within current fields of study at universities should be conducted. Map the curriculum to discover repetition, redundancies, and gaps.
	3. Assessment of curriculum within current fields of study should be conducted using the most important skills as a reference point. These skills should be clearly related to the fields in question (i.e. Excel should be a part of education in Accounting).
	4. Assessment of pedagogical effectiveness should be conducted for each instructor at the universities in Kosovo (simply put, are the instructors good?).
	5. Create a program for academic success for students at risk, and who have faced academic warnings or probation. This would include mandatory requirements as conditions for re-entrance or when students are at a certain grade-point average.
	6. Create an improvement version of the IT Concentration with input from industry. It is the largest growing sector in Kosovo. Therefore universities need to create a better relationship with the principal players within this important field.
	7. Create an effective communication plan among all faculty, staff, and administration. Such a plan should detail expectations and outcomes.
	8. Create a relationship with the top five to ten high schools that supply us with students. This relationship should allow for discussion in better preparing students for college. The skills identified in this study should be the leading factors in the discussion
	9. Create an effective systematic assessment of faculty and curriculum.
	10. Training put in place for all faculty on curriculum development and pedagogy.
	11. Create an advising system where faculty is involved. Students need to know an academic is monitoring their academic performance and keeping them accountable.
	12. Create a concentration in Food Engineering and Management. Given the considerable production of produce in Kosovo this type of degree is very useful. This concentration requires more time to design and therefore should not be implemented until various experts have been involved in its creation.
	13. Create a concentration in Health Care Management/Administration. This concentration would need to be designed from the beginning. There is a massive need for these types of graduates.
	14. Create a platform for discussion on improved engineering degrees between the main universities in Kosovo such as A.U.K. and University of Prishtina. This platform would help create concentrations in systems engineering and electrical engineering (or others as decided by the experts) with co-operation between A.U.K., UP, and other possible parties. Between the industry itself, A.U.K., University of Prishtina, and the government a cooperative effort can be created to make programs that meet international standards for a reasonable cost to the people of Kosovo.
	15. An updated study on educational needs should be conducted minimum every two years.

**Planning Method for Curriculum Development and New Programs.**

If we are to serve the society of Kosovo by creating useful graduates with skills needed for the growth of the country a plan needs to be put in place. Most of the experts interviewed showed strong interest in participating in improving the curriculum at A.U.K. and UP to make a difference for Kosovo. The following is a plan suggested in complementing the curriculum at A.U.K. with the needs of Kosovo.

1. Assess the current curriculum and clearly outline learning outcomes. Map out the courses in each curriculum to discover success and failures in matching expectations of learning outcomes.
2. Create an advisory panel of 4-6 members most prominent in the respective fields. In fields such as economics, public policy, and international relations, it would be important to include a government official as well. This panel should be an integral part of curriculum development within each concentration. Regular communication should take place between the panel and faculty on assessment of the curriculum and the effectiveness of the education of graduates.
3. Create a draft of a curriculum and present it to the panel. If the curriculum is already set then that should be presented to the panel. During 2-3 meetings the curriculum should be amended until it addresses both the soft and hard skills needed for the sector. Each major course should have clear outcomes of both soft and hard skills. The soft skills should be incorporated into the assignments, projects, and exams of each course as needed. Each concentration would be examined on the basis of this study and the feedback given by the experts. Skills specified for fields needed would be incorporated into the curriculum.
4. This advisory panel should meet twice a year for updates and discussion. This is especially important when graduates from these new programs begin to emerge in the ranks of employees within the sector.
5. Implementation of the curriculum using industry experts as guest lecturers or, at a minimum, as evaluators of the effectiveness of the curriculum. The curriculum should be systematically evaluated and assessed on a yearly basis.
6. Establish a program of scholarships within each sector. The organizations and companies involved in the creation of the curriculum, as well as others, should be expected to provide special scholarships for our students. The amount of scholarships could be as small as 500 Euros per year for one student from small companies, to larger and more systematic scholarship plans from larger companies. This needs to be sold as investment in the youth of Kosovo. Furthermore, it should be sold as a way to avoid costly training of college graduates, allowing them to become productive far sooner than before when hired.
7. Establish Co-Ops and/or internships within the sector for our students. An honors project at A.U.K. found that many of the Co-Ops students completed were not related to their preferred field of study (Lumbardh Sokoli). The specific needs of each sector should be clear to all. Both the company and the student should sign a contract where specific industry skills are listed as a requirement of training during the Co-op period.

**Curriculum Assessment.**

There is clear need to assess our curriculum. The model in figure 1 suggests a way to examine each course within a concentration.

*FIGURE 1*

*OBJECTIVES →INPUT → STRUCTURE → PROCESS → OUTCOME*

Each course should have a clear set of objectives. This would include the material coverage as well as soft skills that will be integrated into the course.

The input would include specific course materials, readings, programs and other materials needed to fulfill the need of course coverage.

The structure would involve a detailed planning of the course regarding time, coverage of objectives, and the planning of assessment completions.

The process and outcomes would be examined together as the outcomes would dictate the process of the course. The critical factor of course development is to identify the outcomes expected. The students should have mastered certain skills and obtained certain knowledge at the end of the course. The process of assessment of the knowledge and skills obtained has to be thorough and clear to both students and any accreditation agencies examining our institution.

Each concentration needs to be examined, course by course, using a systematic approach to assess its value. A simple check list of both hard skills (from textbooks and other materials) and soft skills (critical thinking, communication, independence, time management, etc.) needs to be created for each concentration. For this check list the concentration courses should collectively cover all that is needed on the basis of input from the relevant industry experts, as well as the educational experts.

The foundation courses from the liberal arts part of the education at universities should also be assessed at the same level. Currently the educational system in Kosovo has minimal assessment methods employed. It is clear there is a vast difference in quality between K-12 schools in Kosovo. Furthermore, education in Kosovo seems to lack the teaching of many soft skills. An assessment of students would have to keep this in mind. A decision will have to be made as to where students should receive such skills and what curriculum changes should be made in that regard. Finally, pedagogical methods need to be examined.

As a point in case the outsourcing of services has become one of the main exports in Kosovo. This outsourcing mainly takes place in German speaking countries. It would therefore be of interest to universities to examine the possible addition of German to the liberal arts program.

**Co-Op Programs and Internships.**

Several of the comments touched upon the lack of practical training. The expert comments clearly support the results revealed by an Honors Project submitted this year at A.U.K. (Lumbardh Sokoli) that even when Co-ops or internships were completed, very little of the training was focused on the particular needs of the students. Human and financial resources must be directed toward a comprehensive and consistent set of Work Integrated Learning (WIL) initiatives. Globally there is strong movement toward WIL as it is deemed to produce much stronger graduates. WIL is defined as “an educational approach that aligns academic and workplace practices for the mutual benefit of students and workplaces.” (Work-Integrated Learning: Good Practice Guide, Council on Higher Education South Africa. Higher Education Monitor No.12 August 2011)

To make Co-ops successful a better relationship needs to be established with the relevant companies and organizations. A detailed contract between The University and each organization should be established and signed. Each Co-op should have detailed and rigorous documentation of the process of the co-op, duties, and requirements. The practice guide mentioned above could prove to be a useful tool in making Co-op programs more effective.

Once the Co-op is established a university coordinator should contact the supervisor and discusses what should be done. Benchmarks should be created by faculty within each concentration and specific field of study. The co-op should then be evaluated both during the time of the co-op as well as at the end of it. Both the supervisor and the student should be required to answer questions related to the effectiveness of the training of the student.

**CONCLUSIONS**

This study provided a valuable input from experts on the educational needs in Kosovo. The experts showed clear desire and eagerness to participate in improving the curriculum at the universities in Kosovo. In fact, many of the interviewees expressed pleasure of having been contacted for this study. They look upon universities as essential to help make Kosovo better for their industry and for the country in general. This provides a great opportunity for all interested university leaders to establish themselves more firmly as much needed institutions for industry and business support and development in the country.

If universities improve their programs, and begin to create effective relations with industry and government in Kosovo, there is much opportunity to make tertiary education in Kosovo far more effective, sustainable, and profitable than currently is the case.

APPENDIX A

Survey Instrument

The survey instrument was created as a guideline rather than a step-by-step questionnaire. Not all questions were relevant to a particular interview. For example, a head of association did not respond questions 7-10 for the association but rather for the field the association represents. Also, interviewees added much feedback during the interviews outside the scope of the study. Such comments were carefully recorded and appear in this study. Only the last page of the study (skills) was given to the interviewees for examination and response. Commonly they added some further comments during that process. Again, that was carefully recorded.

One of the assistants, Adriana Sejfia or Lumbardh Zagragja, was always present at all interviews to record, and help with translation when needed.

***EDUCATION STUDY***

DEMOGRAPHICS

|  |  |
| --- | --- |
| 1. Name of organization
 |  |
| 1. Name of respondent
 |  |
| 1. Respondent occupation/title
 |  |
| 1. Type of organization/industry
 |  |
| 1. Size of organization (no. of employees)
 |  |
| 1. Location of organization
 |  |
| 1. Number of college graduates within the organization (%)
 |  |
| 1. Expected current/ future need of college graduates
 |  |
| 1. List of type of graduates needed within 1/5/10 years
 |  |

SPECIALIZATION REQUIRED FOR YOUR INDUSTRY

|  |  |
| --- | --- |
| 1. What kind of specializations do you look for in your field?

Ask about majors/concentrations/fields of study | 1. What specific skills do you expect from the employees within each specialization?
 |
|  | LIST OF SPECIFIC SKILLS |
| 1. Specialization

\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_ | 1. \_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_
2. \_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_
3. \_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_
4. \_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_
5. \_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_
6. \_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_
7. \_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_
 |
| 1. Specialization

\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_ | 1. \_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_
2. \_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_
3. \_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_
4. \_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_
5. \_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_
6. \_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_
7. \_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_
 |
| 1. Specialization

\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_ | 1. \_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_
2. \_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_
3. \_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_
4. \_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_
5. \_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_
6. \_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_
7. \_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_
 |
| 1. Specialization

\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_ | 1. \_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_
2. \_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_
3. \_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_
4. \_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_
5. \_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_
6. \_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_
7. \_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_
 |
| 1. Specialization

\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_ | 1. \_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_
2. \_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_
3. \_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_
4. \_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_
5. \_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_
6. \_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_
7. \_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_
 |
| 1. Specialization

\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_ | 1. \_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_
2. \_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_
3. \_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_
4. \_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_
5. \_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_
6. \_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_
7. \_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_
 |

SKILLS

Please rate the importance of the following skills for your industry:

|  |  |
| --- | --- |
| Skill | Rating |
|   |  Very important | Somewhat important | Somewhat unimportant | Not important at all |
| Critical thinking |  |  |  |  |
| Analysis |  |  |  |  |
| Writing e-mails |  |  |  |  |
| Writing reports |  |  |  |  |
| Technical writing |  |  |  |  |
| Public speaking |  |  |  |  |
| Meeting skills |  |  |  |  |
| Team work |  |  |  |  |
| Internet navigation |  |  |  |  |
| Excel |  |  |  |  |
| Powerpoint |  |  |  |  |
| Publisher |  |  |  |  |
| Language (English) |  |  |  |  |
| Organization |  |  |  |  |
| Time management |  |  |  |  |
| International culture |  |  |  |  |
| Independence |  |  |  |  |
| Being proactive |  |  |  |  |
| Math/statistics |  |  |  |  |
| Taking initiative |  |  |  |  |
| Conflict resolution |  |  |  |  |
| Creative thinking |  |  |  |  |
| Abstract thinking |  |  |  |  |
| Efficient planning |  |  |  |  |
| Positive attitude |  |  |  |  |
| Adaptability |  |  |  |  |
| Problem-solving |  |  |  |  |
| Work ethic |  |  |  |  |
| Self-discipline |  |  |  |  |
| Self-motivation |  |  |  |  |
| Team-motivation |  |  |  |  |
| Stress management |  |  |  |  |
| Secondary data analysis |  |  |  |  |
| Qualitative research |  |  |  |  |

APPENDIX B

List of Experts

1.     Arjeta Lleshi, National Programme Officer, Swiss Cooperation Office Kosovo,  Str. Rexhep Mala No.6, 10000 Prishtina, Kosovo, [arjeta.lleshi@sdc.net](https://mail.aukonline.org/owa/redir.aspx?C=6f3a8d93bcd94b0e96b9c1cfbacb8029&URL=mailto%3aarjeta.lleshi%40sdc.net), +38138248091

2.     Christoph I. Lang, Deputy Director, Swiss Cooperation Office Kosovo, Str. Rexhep Mala, No.6, 10000 Prishtina, Kosovo, [christoph.lang@sdc.net](https://mail.aukonline.org/owa/redir.aspx?C=6f3a8d93bcd94b0e96b9c1cfbacb8029&URL=mailto%3achristoph.lang%40sdc.net), +38138248096

3.     Heini Conrad, Country Director, Helvetas, Nazim Gafurri nr.33,10000 Prishtina, Kosovo,[heini.conrad@helvetas.org](https://mail.aukonline.org/owa/redir.aspx?C=6f3a8d93bcd94b0e96b9c1cfbacb8029&URL=mailto%3aheini.conrad%40helvetas.org), +38138517715 ext. 101

4.     Visar Hapciu, Policy and Project Officer, American Chamber of Commerce, Fehmi Agani str. No 36/3, 10000 Prishtina, Kosovo, [visar.hapciu@amchamksv.org](https://mail.aukonline.org/owa/redir.aspx?C=6f3a8d93bcd94b0e96b9c1cfbacb8029&URL=mailto%3avisar.hapciu%40amchamksv.org) ,+381248012

5.     Blerim Gjoci, The Group, [info@thegroup-ks.com](https://mail.aukonline.org/owa/redir.aspx?C=6f3a8d93bcd94b0e96b9c1cfbacb8029&URL=mailto%3ainfo%40thegroup-ks.com) , +37744500723

6.     Vjollca Cavolli, Executive Director, STIKK, Str. Rexhep Mala, No. 28/A, 10000 Prishtina, Kosovo, [vcavolli@stikk-ks.org](https://mail.aukonline.org/owa/redir.aspx?C=6f3a8d93bcd94b0e96b9c1cfbacb8029&URL=mailto%3avcavolli%40stikk-ks.org), +38138771180 ext. 500

7.     Shkelzen Kelmendi, Human Resources Manager, NLB Prishtina, Str. Nena Tereze, 49/a, 10000 Prishtina, Kosovo, [kelmendi.shkelzen@nlbprishtina-kos.com](https://mail.aukonline.org/owa/redir.aspx?C=6f3a8d93bcd94b0e96b9c1cfbacb8029&URL=mailto%3akelmendi.shkelzen%40nlbprishtina-kos.com), +38138240230 ext. 066

8.     Dukagjin Pupovci, Director, Kosova Education Center, Str. Isa Kastrati, 10000, Prishtina, Kosovo, [dpupovci@kec-ks.org](https://mail.aukonline.org/owa/redir.aspx?C=6f3a8d93bcd94b0e96b9c1cfbacb8029&URL=mailto%3adpupovci%40kec-ks.org), +38138244257

9.     Valton Bilalli, Marigona Residence, [valton@marigonaresidence.com](https://mail.aukonline.org/owa/redir.aspx?C=6f3a8d93bcd94b0e96b9c1cfbacb8029&URL=mailto%3avalton%40marigonaresidence.com), + 38649111249

10.     Driton Hapciu, Chief Strategy Officer, Cacttus, Str. Rexhep Mala No. 29, 10000 Prishtina, Kosovo, [dritonh@cacttus.com](https://mail.aukonline.org/owa/redir.aspx?C=6f3a8d93bcd94b0e96b9c1cfbacb8029&URL=mailto%3adritonh%40cacttus.com) +38138246868 #122

11. Valmira Rexhëbeqaj, Director Economic and Public Policy Department, Str. Nëna Terezë 10000, Prishtina, Kosovo, vrexhebeqaj@mfe-ks.org , +3813820034462

 12. Stephen Creskoff, International Trade and Legal Consultant, Chemonics , Str. Gustav Mayer, Nr.23,10000, Prishtina,Kosovo, screskoff@aol.com , ++38138221870

 13. Agon Gashi , CEO, Meridian express, Str. Zagrebi 39,Arberia, Prishtina, Kosovo, agon.gashi@meridianexpress.com ,+38138223087

 14. Milaim Mjeku, Management Development Associates, Str. Perandori Justunian ,Nr.12, 10000,Prishtina,Kosovo

 15.Safet Gerxhaliu, President , Kosova Chamber of Commerce ,Str. Nena Tereze, Nr.20, 10000, Prishtina, Kosovo, safet.gerxhaliu@oek-kcc.org, +38138224741

 16.Alban Ibrahimi ,CEO, Frutomania , Str. Pejton, Ramiz Sadiku Colony,10000, Prishtina, Kosovo, alban.ibrahimi@frutomaniaks.com ,+37745511071

17. Vjollca Parduzi, Human Resources Manager, Asseco South East Europe, Veternik, Industrial Zone, pn, 10000 Prishtina, Kosovo, vjollca.parduzi@asseco-see.com , +386 (0) 49 69 26 09

18. Avni Gashi, Head of Human Resource Management Unit, Bank for Private Business, St. UCK, nr. 41, Prishtina, Kosovo, avni.gashi@bpbbank.com, +377 (0) 44 416 889

19. Ardiana Bunjaku. Association of Certified Accountants, St. Sylejman Vokshi, nr. 14, Prishtina, Kosovo, +38138-249-043

20. Korab Krasniqi, Chief Marketing Officer, 3CIS J.C.S., kkrasniqi@3CIS.net, +386 49 15-16-16

21. Arta Limani, Audit Manager, Deloitte Kosova Sh.p.k., alimani@deloittece.com

22. Adem Selmani, Executive Director, Insurance Association of Kosova, adem.selmani@shs-ks.com

23. Armir Dermala, Managing Partner, B.D.O. Kosova L.L.C, amir.dermala@bdokosovo.com

24. Bernard Nikaj, Senior Political Adviser, Ministry of Trade and Finance, St. Muharrem Fejza, office 126, Prishtina Kosovo, Bernard.nikaj@rks-gov.net +3813820036553

25. Vllaznim Xhiha, Chairman, St, Agim Ramadani, 28/4, Prishtina, Kosovo, vllaznim.xhiha@eye-ks.com, +37744226829

 APPENDIX C

Additional Comments

1. **Shkelzen Kelmendi, NLB Prishtina, Human Resource Department**

Comment 1: Calculating without a calculator is not done, basic math skills missing.

Comment 2: Grammar skills in Albanian and English are poor.

1. **Vjollca Parduzi, ASSECO SEE, Human Resources Manager**

Comment 1: A more practical approach to the problems, rather than just learning them in theory.

Comment 2: Many soft skills are missing such as planning, time management, and being proactive.

1. **Vjollca Ҫavolli, STIKK, Executive Director**

Comment 1: New companies are coming in the ICT sector. No entrepreneurial or management skills.

Comment 2: 35 startups at Innovation Center Kosova outsourcing services to U.S. or Europe. We need to focus in outsourcing.

Comment 3: Need: Documenting things (job descriptions, contracts).

Comment 4: International relations and marketing skills are needed.

1. **Alban Ibrahimi, FRUTO MANIA, CEO**

Comment 1: Vocational skills lacking.

Comment 2 : No graduates that can help with international relations and global marketing.

1. **Milaim Mjeku, MDA, HR Manager**

Comment 1: Communication needed.

Comment 2: Writing Skills needed.

Comment 3: Entrepreneurial skills needed.

1. **Bernard Nikaj, Senior Political Adviser, Ministry of Trade and Industry**

Comment 1: Entrepreneurship skills needed.

Comment 2: Skills related to writing, critical thinking, and math are missing.

Comment 3: Lack of very skilled workers.

Comment 4: Lack of communication between universities and the market.

Comment 5: More interdisciplinary training needed in the education system.

Comment 6: Programmers are needed. Technical engineers are missing in Kosovo.

Comment 7: Outsourcing and IT are major points of growth. We need people with skills in global market. IT is the biggest growth sector in Kosovo.

Comment 8: Investing in curriculum development and changing the methods of learning are of crucial importance.

Comment 9: Hospitals and other health care facilities are a mess because there is no health-care management system here.

Comment 10: Public Policy departments at universities in Kosovo are ignoring governance and management education and focusing too much on theory.

Comment 11: Teach students to be proactive.

Comment 12: International relations need to be improved for growth.

1. **Ardiana Bunjaku, Association of Certified Accountants**

Comment 1: There is a need for supreme auditing certification and auditors. This is in the works at the association.

Comment 2; Journalists and business people do not know how to read financial statements. They need to learn how.

Comment 3: There is no cooperation between governments and businesses and universities. There is no training in curriculum development or pedagogy.

Comment 4: Governmental research should be carried by students, not NGOs. NGO programs have no long-term effect.

Comment 5: Vocational training needed. Co-op programs at universities are not checked for quality. Are students really being trained as they should?

Comment 6: New and innovative ideas are missing. Entrepreneurial are skills missing.

Comment 7: UP graduates are poor. For example, heir engineer graduates lack fundamental skills required and there is no professional integrity in education at all.

1. **Heini Conrad, Director, Helvetas**

Comment 1: Universities in Kosova are more concerned with quantity rather than quality.

1. **Visar Hapciu, Policy and Project Officer, American Chamber of Commerce**

Comment 1: Employees should have self-initiative, self-discipline, and respect the job.

Comment 2: There is a need for individuals who know how to plan strategically and are good in processing.

Comment 3: Arbitration of business disputes is also needed.

1. **Safet Gerxhaliu, President, Kosovo Chamber of Commerce**

Comment 1: New thinking is needed in Kosovo. Graduates need to be entrepreneurial and forward thinking. They need to show real ambition for change.

Comment 2: Lack of vision and long term planning & thinking.

Comment 3: Lack of job descriptions and accountability.

Comment 4: No processes.

1. **Arjeta Lleshi and Christoph I. Lang, Swiss Cooperation Office**

Comment 1: Much of the workforce lacks proper education.

Comment 2: Working on mobilizing training among 15-29 by encouraging employers to invest in employees. No outcomes yet on their program.

Comment 3: Systematic change in society takes time.

1. **Blerim Gjoci, Director, The Group**

Comment 1: Education system has not kept up with the changes in the world.

Comment 2: Loss of culture of communication and debate.

1. **Dukagjin Pupovci, Director, Kosovo Education Center**

Comment 1: Pedagogical skills are missing.

Comment 2: Curriculum development skills are lacking.

Comment 3: Everything is judged by input, not outcomes. No process or structure.

1. **Valmira Rexhebeqaj, Head of Economic Policy Department, Ministry of Finance**

Comment 1: People who can identify revenue streams are missing.

Comment 2: Desperately need graduates with strong analytical skills. Particularly needed are people with knowledge in financial management.

Comment 3: Avoidance of taxes is common. Over 1 million adults are in Kosovo. Of those, about 500,000 are students or unemployed. Only 210,000 pay taxes.

Comment 4: Many assumptions made in modeling of economic development. This is largely due to lack of sophisticated data gathering at all levels of government (local and federal).

1. **Driton Hapciu, Chief Strategy Officer, Cacttus**

Comment 1: German language is very important.

Comment 2: Business ethics is very important.

Comment 3: Math and logic skills are missing.

Comment 4: We should focus in outsourcing in German-speaking countries.

Comment 5: Curriculums should be tailored to market needs. Systems- engineering missing.

Comment 6: Many mistakes made in government because inexperienced people were in charge from 1999 and were implementing the wrong projects.

Comment 7: Visited MIT and Stanford and the IT programs there are so far ahead of programs in Kosovo there is no comparison.

Comment 8: Self- motivation is of huge importance and largely missing from college graduates.

1. **Avni Gashi, Private Bank for Business**

Comment 1: Need people in international Relations as there is so much need to expand outside the country. The field is especially lacking in legal issues.

Comment 2: Excel is very important in banking, finance, and accounting.

Comment 3: More people are needed who know business administration.

1. **Vllaznim Xhiha, Entrepreneur, Chair EYE**

Comment 1: no skills in knowing the business processes

Comment 2: Food processing can be an important opportunity

Comment 3: Outsourcing services in European countries (German speaking countries) is also very important

Comment 4: There are no structured entrepreneurs, no analytical skills.

Comment 5: Managing resources and writing strategies and planning are very problematic.

1. **Stephen Creskoff, International Trade and Legal Consultant, USAID**

Comment 1: Kosovo should focus on the service sector, not manufacturing

Comment 2: IT & Accounting services

Comment 3: Better intern programs that prepare people for the workplace, especially international programs

Comment 4: Professors at UP are not good and are not professional (miss classes regularly)

1. **Agon Gashi, CEO Meridian Express**

Comment 1: People that know how to read financial statements are in need

Comment 2: Desperately need people in the Human Resource Management field. Need people who understand motivation, planning and strategy for employees, and creating goals as well as assessing effectiveness of employees

Code

1. Lack of writing and basic math skills
2. Planning
3. Documents and job descriptions
4. A.U.K. students do not have the appropriate behavior in the job
5. Vocational training
6. Entrepreneurial skills
7. A.U.K. students not very proactive
8. Curriculums currently are not tailored to market needs
9. A.U.K. is not offering the proper IT program

 10- We should focus in preparing students for outsourcing

1. Curriculum development skills are lacking

 12 - International Relations

|  |  |
| --- | --- |
| Comment | Number of times it has been mentioned  |
| 1 | 4 |
| 2 | 3 |
| 3 | 2 |
| 4 | 3 |
| 5 | 2 |
| 6 | 3 |
| 7 | 2 |
| 8 | 4 |
| 9 | 2 |
| 10 | 2 |
| 11 | 2 |
| 12 | 3 |

APPENDIX D

|  |
| --- |
| TABLE 3List of skills  |
| SKILLS | AVERAGE SCORE ON A 4-POINT SCALE | PERCENTAGE MOST IMPORTANT |
| Critical Thinking | 1.08 | 91.7% |
| Analytical skills | 1.12 | 78.3% |
| Organizational Management | 1.13 | 87.0% |
| Work Ethic | 1.16 | 87.5% |
| Self-Motivation | 1.21 | 78.3% |
| Efficient Planning | 1.21 | 78.3% |
| Positive Attitude | 1.25 | 75.0% |
| Self-Discipline | 1.25 | 75.0% |
| Teamwork | 1.25 | 75.0% |
| Writing Reports | 1.29 | 70.8% |
| Team Motivation | 1.29 | 70.8% |
| Time Management | 1.29 | 70.8% |
| Being Proactive | 1.33 | 69.6% |
| Problem Solving | 1.33 | 66.7% |
| English Language | 1.37 | 75.0% |
| Adaptability | 1.37 | 70.8% |
| Creative Thinking | 1.37 | 62.5% |
| Technical Writing | 1.43 | 56.5% |
| Qualitative Research | 1.45 | 66.7% |
| Taking Initiative | 1.46 | 62.5% |
| Independence | 1.50 | 62.5% |
| Conflict Resolution | 1.50 | 62.5% |
| Stress Management | 1.52 | 65.0% |
| Meeting Skills | 1.52 | 56.5% |
| Math/Statistics | 1.56 | 54.2% |
| Excel | 1.58 | 45.8% |
| Public Speaking | 1.65 | 47.8% |
| International Culture | 1.67 | 50.0% |
| Secondary Data Analysis | 1.71 | 45.8% |
| Writing E-mails | 1.75 | 41.7% |
| Abstract Thinking | 1.82 | 36.4% |
| Internet Navigation | 1.87 | 39.1% |
| Power Point | 1.87 | 25.0% |
| Publisher | 2.25 | 20.8% |

REFERENCES

Dalipi, D. (2010).*Skills Gap Analysis for Wood Processing Industry.* Retrieved from: <http://transition.usaid.gov/kosovo/eng/>

Hamilton, A. B., Murray, C. (2009). *YES Program Feasibility Study.* Retrieved from: <http://transition.usaid.gov/kosovo/eng/>

Investment Promotion Agency of Kosovo. (n.d.) *Invest in Kosovo.* Retrieved from:

<http://www.invest-ks.org/>

USAID (2007). *Assessment of Kosovo Information and Communications Technologies (ICT) Sector.* Retrieved from: <http://transition.usaid.gov/kosovo/eng/>

USAID (2009). *A modern workforce development system is key to Kosovo’s growth.* Retrieved from: <http://transition.usaid.gov/kosovo/eng/>

USAID (2009). *Workforce Development-Regional Overview: Kosovo.* Retrieved from: <http://transition.usaid.gov/kosovo/eng/>

USAID (2011). *ICT Country Profile: Kosovo.* Retrieved from: <http://transition.usaid.gov/kosovo/eng/>

USAID (2011) Kosovo Private Enterprise Program & STIKK. *Skills Gap Analysis for Information and Communication Technology.* Retrieved from: <http://transition.usaid.gov/kosovo/eng/>

Sokoli, L. (2013) *Assessment and Viability for an IT Concentration Expansion at A.U.K..* An honor’s project paper at the American University in Kosovo.

Poverty Reduction and Economic Management Unit Europe and Central Asia Region (2010). *Kosovo-Unlocking Growth Potential: Strategies, Policies, Actions.* Retrieved from: <http://www.worldbank.org/>

Weidman, J., Herschbach, D., Naskova, Z., Price-Rom, A., Pupovci, D.,& Rexhaj, Xh. (2009). *Assessment of Basic Education/Pre-university Education in Kosovo.* Retrieved from: <http://transition.usaid.gov/kosovo/eng/>

The Expert Group on Future Skills Needs Statement of Activity 2012, April 2013. A report on skills needs in the workforce in Ireland. Retrieved from: <http://www.skillsireland.ie/>

Kosovo Human Development Report 2012: Private Sector and Employment. United Nations Development Programme and the Swiss Development Cooperation Office. Retrieved from: <http://www.kosovo.undp.org/repository/docs/KHDR2012-Eng-Web-L_830975.pdf>

Work-Integrated Learning: Good Practice Guide, Council on Higher Education South Africa. Higher Education Monitor No.12 August 2011. Retrieved from: <http://www.ru.ac.za/media/rhodesuniversity/content/communityengagement/documents/Higher_Education_Monitor_12.pdf>

Rexhaj, X. (2001). Higher Education Reforms in Kosova: A case of strong international

influence in local reforms. Budapest. (Unpublished report).